
The issue of giving advice before spreading a refutation

Translated by Abbas Abu Yahya

Article taken and slightly adapted from: followingthesunnah.wordpress.com

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

Shaykh al-Albaanee (رَحْمَةُ اللَّهِ)¹ was asked:

‘What branches off from this [previous question: mentioning the good deeds of an individual while refuting him] is the statement of some of the people or more correctly should I say, the condition set by some of the people who say that in the case of refutations it’s necessary before it being printed, that a copy is sent to the one being refuted so that they can look into it. They say that this is from the Manhaj of the Salaf?’

Shaykh al-Albaanee (رَحْمَةُ اللَّهِ) answers:

‘This is not a condition, however if it’s easy to do, and it is hoped from this practice to bring that person closer without making the case well-known between the people, then there is no doubt that this matter is good.

As for firstly making it a condition, and then secondly making it a general condition then this is not at all from wisdom in any circumstances.

The people, as you all know, are of different natures, like the natures of gold and silver. So the one whom you know from him that he is with us on the path and methodology and that he would accept the advice, wherein you can at least write to him without making his mistake public as you see it, then this is good.

However, this is not a condition, even if this was a condition it’s not a possible matter, where can you get that person’s address? How can you contact him? Then, will you get a response from him or not? These are matters which are absolutely speculative.. . . implementing this condition is very difficult, that is why this point is not conditional.’

[Taken from the cassette entitled: ‘al-Muwwazanaat Fee Naqd’ Side A from the ‘Silsilah al-Huda wa Noor’ No.638]

¹ (رَحْمَةُ اللَّهِ) (rahimahullaah) May Allaah the Most High have mercy on him